

# Insights into Halacha

- Rabbi Yehuda Spitz

Ohr Somayach (yspitz@ohr.edu)

## More on Kiddush

*Ed. note: Some footnotes are included in the PT version of the article; most are not. Some of those that are included have been edited and shortened. See the website for full footnotes and sources.*

Have you ever wondered why after partaking of Kiddush in shul, many people nonetheless make Kiddush again at the onset of their Shabbat Day Seuda? If one already fulfilled their Kiddush obligation in shul, what could the requirement possibly be for another at home? How many times must Kiddush be recited? Additionally, if people generally make Kiddush on Mezonot on Shabbat Day, why don't we do that on Friday night as well? Interestingly, the answers to all of these questions are intertwined. But to gain a proper understanding of the relevant issues, some background is order.

The fourth of the Aseret Hadibrot is the exhortation to remember and keep the Shabbat properly. In fact, the Gemara (P'sachim 106a) teaches us that ZACHOR ET YOM HASHABBAT L'KAD'SHO is not only the basis of our obligation to make Kiddush upon Shabbats's entrance on Friday night, but also a support for making Kiddush on Shabbat day.

*Parshat Yitro (Sh'mot 20:7-11). Although not exact to the lashon of the Aseret Hadibrot featured in Va'etchanan (D'varim 5:12), SHAMOR ET YOM HASHABBAT L'KAD'SHO..., nevertheless, we know that SHAMOR V'ZACHOR B'DIBUR ECHAD (as mentioned in Rav Shlomo Alkabetz's timeless L'cha Dodi). In fact, it is precisely this nuance that teaches us the joint obligations of positive and negative commandments (Zachor V'Shamor) on Shabbat, which obligates women the same as men.*

There are differences, however. Friday night's Kiddush, marking the beginning of Shabbat, is an actual chiyuv D'orayta, based on the pasuk. Yet, Shabbat day's Kiddush is purely a rabbinic enactment to honor the Shabbat. As the Rashbam (P'sachim 106a s.v. AMAR) citing the Sheiltot d'Rav Achai Gaon (Parshat Yitro 54) explains, the reason why we make Kiddush on Shabbat day is in order to show honor to the day, by drinking wine, which highlights the difference between weekday and Shabbat. One practical difference between the two is that the preamble to Friday night Kiddush (VAYCHULU) is actually part of the Kiddush, attesting to Hashem's creation of the world in six days, as opposed to Shabbat day, when the sum total of the Kiddush is really just the bracha of 'Hagafen'.

## Defining Delight

Yet, there is another integral component to Kiddush besides the Kiddush itself. The Gemara P'sachim

(101a), citing Shmuel, and duly codified as halacha, rules that Kiddush must be performed B'MAKOM SEUDA, in the same place as a meal. In other words, in order to fulfill the Kiddush obligation, it must serve as the preamble to an actual Seuda.

The Rashbam (ad loc. s.v. AF) explains that this halacha is gleaned from the pasuk in Yeshayahu (58:13) V'KARATA LASHABBAT ONEG, and you will proclaim Shabbat as a delight for you, meaning in the same place where you proclaim Shabbat (making Kiddush), there must also be the delight (referring to celebrating the Shabbat meal).

But now that we know that Kiddush must always come before a Seuda, what exactly must this Seuda consist of? How do we define this 'delight'? Here is where it gets complicated. Both Tosafot and the Rosh explicitly state that this Seuda must be an actual bread meal, meaning the full Shabbat repast replete with washing, Mayim Acharonim, and Bentching. However, the Tur cites an opinion of the Gaonim that for this halacha, Seuda does not necessarily mean a full Seuda, but rather eating only a bit (ACHAL DAVAR MU'AT) or even drinking a cup of wine is sufficient.

The Beit Yosef opines that Tosafot and the Rosh did not mean to actually argue on the Gaonim, but rather they would agree that a full meal is not mandated. In this case, in order to constitute a meal, a small amount of bread would suffice, as would drinking a cup of wine.

Although many question the Beit Yosef's supposition of Tosafot and the Rosh's opinion, nevertheless, in his Shulchan Aruch, the Beit Yosef codifies this as actual halacha, that one may fulfill his obligation of KIDDUSH B'MAKOM SEUDA utilizing (an additional cup of) wine as his Seuda.

## **Munching Mezonot**

The Magen Avraham takes this ruling a step further. He explains that if a Seuda for Kiddush purposes includes wine, whose bracha is HaGafen, then certainly it would include MINEI TARGIMA, types of cakes and cookies (of the five grains), whose bracha is Mezonot. This is because in the order of preference of brachot Mezonot is considered more important than HaGafen. If so, certainly one may consider noshing on Mezonot as a Seuda for Kiddush purposes.

This novel approach of the Magen Avraham's was accepted and considered 'Minhag Yisrael' by all sectors of world Jewry. That is why by almost any Kiddush in almost any shul anywhere in the world it is de rigeur to have a Kiddush with minei Mezonot as the Seuda.

## **Kiddush Controversy**

However, not every authority agreed with the Magen Avraham's view. For example, Rabbi Akiva Eiger argues that neither wine nor Mezonot should fit in the Seuda category. Moreover, the Vilna Gaon famously did not rely on this

leniency, and made certain that his Kiddush (even on Shabbat day) was exclusively 'B'makom Seuda Gemura', meaning, a full bread Shabbat Seuda, 'from soup to nuts'.

Although here the Vilna Gaon's shita is considered a minority opinion, nevertheless, the Pri Megadim, Mishna Berura, and Aruch HaShulchan all ruled that it is preferable to be particular to perform Kiddush along with a full Seuda.

*Although, in his Mishna Berura, the Chofetz Chayim fully rules like the Magen Avraham, on the other hand, in his Bi'ur Halacha, he only cites the Vilna Gaon's opinion, implying his predilection to be machmir for this shita. This is similar to the Pri Megadim, who, likewise, in Orach Chayim 273 rules like the Mogen Avrohom, but in Orach Chayim 271 (Eishel Avrohom 3), he writes that MIKOL MAKOM L'CHAT-CHILA TOV PAS. The Aruch HaShulchan as well, although stating that the ikar halacha follows the Magen Avraham's ruling, nevertheless concludes that it is preferred (mehadrin) to be makpid on only making Kiddush with a full Seuda. Several contemporary sefarim including Sh'mirat Shabbat K'hilchata and Yalkut Yosef write that indeed it is preferable to be machmir on making Kiddush with actual pas as the Seuda. It is recorded that the Chazon Ish was machmir for the GRA's shita for himself, but not for others.*

Based on this, as well as the opinions of many Rishonim, there are those who are makpid not to make Kiddush unless as part and parcel of a full bread-based Seuda.

## Night or Day

Although the Magen Avraham did not distinguish between the Friday Night and Shabbat Day Kiddush, and held that his ruling should apply equally, on the other hand, Rav Yitzchok Elchanan Spektor, the Kovno Rav and Gadol Hador of the late 1800s, did. He explained that on Shabbat Day, when Kiddush is only mandated d'rabbanan, one may certainly rely on Mezonot as a Seuda. Yet, on Friday night, when Kiddush is an actual chiyuv d'orayta, due to the strength of the opposition to the Magen Avraham's approach, he maintains that one should not rely on mere Mezonot, but should ensure that Kiddush is recited along with an entire bread-based Seudah.

This is why one does not often see a Friday night Kiddush being performed with Mezonot instead of HaMotzi. An interesting upshot of this shita is that many Yeshivot, following the Chazon Ish's precedent based on this approach, do make Kiddush on Simchat Torah night on Mezonot, as the Kiddush on Yom Tov, even at night, is also d'rabbanan.

*See Shu"t Ein Yitzchok (ibid. 5) who explains at length that the obligation for Kiddush on Yom Tov is d'rabbanan. The Chazon Ish's ruling for making Kiddush on Mezonot as the Seuda on Simchat Torah night is widely known; it is cited in Piskei Teshuvos (273, end footnote 68), and is customary in many Yeshivot.*

## Kiddush x 2

This also explains why many are makpid to make Kiddush again as part of their Shabbat Day Seuda at home, even after partaking of Kiddush in shul. As Rav Yosef Chaim Sonnenfeld, and later Rav Moshe Sternbuch pointed out, although according to the normative halacha Kiddush-goers had already fulfilled their obligation in shul, nevertheless, according to the Vilna Gaon, they have not done so at all. Therefore, they aver, in order to ascertain that one be yotzei Kiddush B'makom Seuda according to all opinions, one should make Kiddush again as part of the actual Seuda.

Rav Moshe Feinstein takes a different approach to explain the halachic preference of making Kiddush again at home. He explains that in his opinion, V'KARATA LASHABBAT ONEG has a second, opposite meaning - that in a place where one wants to have an oneg (and any additional eating one does on Shabbat is considered oneg as well) he must also make Kiddush. (This would only apply until one has made Kiddush with bread.)

*Igros Moshe. See also Shu"t V'dibarta Bam (72), quoting Rav Dovid Feinstein. According to this understanding, Rav Moshe also rules that the ikar din follows the Magen Avraham, that one may make Kiddush on Mezonot. However one will not have fully fulfilled his obligation of Kiddush B'Makom Seuda until making Kiddush again as part of a full bread-based Seuda.*

In view of this, Rav Moshe is able to synthesize the opinions of Tosafot and the Rosh with that of the Gaonim. He maintains that Tosafot and the Rosh were referring to the general understanding of the pasuk, that a Seuda for Kiddush requires bread. However, the Gaonim were referring to the secondary understanding of the pasuk, meaning that whenever one wants to eat, one should make Kiddush first. This would include eating Mezonot or even drinking wine, as commonly done at a Kiddush in shul.

It should be clear, however, that according to Rav Moshe, one will not fulfill his full chiyuv of Kiddush B'makom Seuda until making Kiddush again along with a full Seuda.

So the next time you arrive home Shabbat morning to the delicious Seuda waiting, rest assured that by making Kiddush (even after enjoying a Kiddush in shul) you are partaking in the beautiful mitzva of V'KARATA LASHABBAT ONEG.

**Disclaimer: This is not a comprehensive guide, rather a brief summary to raise awareness of the issues. In any real case one should ask a competent Halachic authority.**

Rabbi Yehuda Spitz's recent English halacha sefer, "Food: A Halachic Analysis" (Mosaica/Feldheim) containing over 500 pages featuring over 30 comprehensive chapters discussing the myriad halachic issues pertaining to food, is now available online and in bookstores everywhere."